PSL·巴 黎 九 大
高级工商管理博士
UNIVERSITÉ PARIS DAUPHINE-PSL
Executive Doctorate In Business Administration

Executive DBA, Université Paris Dauphine – PSL

PSL · 巴黎九大高级工商管理博士学位项目

Research on the Influencing Factors of Collective Leadership in Medical Management Teams and Their Impact on the Management Effectiveness——

Taking the Medical Management Team of a Clinical Department in a Tertiary Public Traditional Chinese Medicine Hospital in China as an Example

(Thesis submitted for the degree of Executive Doctorate in Business Administration)

Cohort: 2018

Candidate: Guo Yuhong

Supervisor: Yang Baiyin

22th August, 2024

Dauphine | PSL
UNIVERSITÉ PARIS

CONFIDENTIALITY AND AUTHORIZATION STATEMENT

Information provided by interviewees and their organizations will be kept confidential. To this end, measures have been taken to protect the interests of the participants in the information and other materials provided in this thesis. This thesis is recognized as a confidential document and will be treated in accordance with the confidentiality policy of the University of Paris IX.

In addition, I am fully aware of the regulations of the University of Paris IX concerning the retention and use of the thesis, namely: the University has the right to retain a copy of the thesis and to allow the thesis to be consulted and lent; the University may publish the thesis, in whole or in part, and may preserve it by means of photocopying, microfilming, or other means of reproduction.

Signature:_____Signature of the supervisor:_____Date:_____

ABSTRACT

Leadership is the core element of organizational development. Considering the characteristics of China, most public hospitals adopt the collective leadership model. Since 2017, the Chinese government has successively issued documents including *Guiding Opinions on Establishing a Modern Hospital Management System* and *Opinions on Promoting the High-quality Development of Public Hospitals*. With the rapid and high-quality development of public hospitals, collective leadership has higher requirements.

This study systematically reviewed and summarized previous researches on the connotation of leadership content, leadership measurement, leadership assessment, leadership models, individual leadership and collective leadership, and collective leadership through literature review. On this basis, this study conducted a systematic assessment on collective leadership and public hospital management.

In the empirical research, this paper adopts the Delphi method to study the measurement scale of collective leadership. After determining the scale, this study selected 35 medical teams from a tertiary public Chinese medicine hospital as the research object to measure and conducted a questionnaire survey on them. The research deeply explored the influencing factors and influencing mechanisms of collective leadership and its impact on employee satisfaction, patient satisfaction and the effectiveness of medical team management. In addition, a case study was conducted on the hospital and one of its clinical departments, and a theoretical model of collective leadership of medical management team was preliminarily established.

Following the development of times, this study was grounded in the first-hand data and theory. The research results obtained by correlation verification are of academic value and can be used for reference by other scholars in future research. The summary of the characteristics of management innovation and management suggestions can be used as a practical reference for public medical institutions to innovate management, make breakthroughs, and achieve rapid growth.

Keywords: leadership; collective leadership; satisfaction; performance

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I was flooded with mixed feelings when completing this thesis.

EDBA learning helps me broaden the horizon, and increase the knowledge of management. After determining the research direction, I comprehensively and systematically studied the literature on leadership, collective leadership, and management effectiveness. At the same time, I learned how to carry out literature system evaluation, and mastered research methods such as empirical research and case studies.

COVID-19 broke out during the study. As the head of leading authority for epidemic prevention and control, I have devoted myself to the prevention and control of the coronavirus epidemic since the beginning of 2020. I guided the team to establish the system, draft the process and arrange personnel to support Wuhan, Xiaotangshan and Earth Altar and help to conduct the nucleic acid sampling and vaccination. For several times, the epidemic situation seemed slightly stable and I was ready to throw myself into research. However, another around of epidemic unexpectedly broke out again. When the epidemic eventually came to an end, I was deeply troubled for new working environment, new tasks and institutional restructuring. I even had thoughts of leaving the research. Herein, I really appreciate the encouragement and supervision of Mr. Niu Liqun, the concerted efforts of the research group as well as the understanding and support of Professor Yang Baiyin. Without these help, I may fail to finish the research thesis.

Thanks for the pertinent suggestions proposed by the experts during the pre-defense. Thanks for all teachers in the review group.

Thanks for all the schoolmates, teachers and colleagues who provide support.

This study represents the beginning. The scientific research ideas will be applied to the future management work for the whole life.

TABLE OF CONTENT

ABSTRACT I
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT II
TABLE OF CONTENT III
TABLE OF TABLES IX
TABLE OF FIGURES X
Chapter 1 Introduction 1
1.1 Research Background 1
1.2 Research Questions 6
1.3 Research Purpose 6
1.4 Research Significance 7
1.5 Structure of Thesis 8
1.6 Summary of This Chapter 9
Chapter 2 Literature Review 10
2.1 Leadership Review 10
2.1.1 Leader and leadership 11
2.1.1.1 Definition and Characteristics of Leaders 12
2.1.1.2 Definition and characteristics of leadership 13
2.1.1.3 The Difference Between Lead and Leadership 15
2.1.2 Assessment and Measurement of Leadership 15
2.1.2.1Methods of Leadership Assessment 16
2.1.3 Model of Leadership 20
2.1.4 Individual Leadership and Collective Leadership 21
2.1.4.1 Individual Leadership 21
2.1.4.2 Collective Leadership 26
2.1.5 The Essence of Collective Leadership 29
2.1.6 Dimensions of Collective Leadership and Factors Influencing Measurement Tools 34
2.1.6.1 Dimensions of Collective Leadership 34
2.1.6.2 Measurement Tools for Collective Leadership 35

2.1.6.3 Influencing Factors....37
2.1.6.4 Formation Process....38
2.1.6.5 Influencing Mechanisms....39
2.1.7 Effectiveness of Collective Leadership....40
2.1.8 Impact of Collective Leadership on Team Output....44
2.1.8.1 Impact of Collective Leadership on Team Effectiveness (Output)....45
2.1.8.2 Impact of Collective Leadership on Team Effectiveness and Output Process....46
2.2 Summary of This Chapter....49
Chapter 3 Systematic Review of Literature....50
3.1 Background....50
3.2 Materials and Methods....52
3.2.1 Literature Search Strategy....52
3.2.2 Literature Screening....52
3.2.3 Data Extraction....52
3.2.4 Quality Assessment....52
3.3 Results....52
3.3.1 Literature Search and Screening Flowchart....52
3.3.2 Basic Characteristics of Included Literature (see Figure 3-1)....53
3.3.3 Literature Quality Assessment Results....54
3.3.4 Status of Research on Collective Leadership: Qualitative Analysis....55
3.3.4.1 Types of Research and Research Quality....55
3.3.4.2 Definitions of Collective Leadership....55
3.3.4.3 Components of Collective Leadership....56
3.3.4.4 Methods for Evaluating Collective Leadership....56
3.3.4.5 Strategies for Enhancing Collective Leadership....57
3.4 Discussion and Recommendations....58
3.5 Summary of This Chapter....60
Chapter 4 Overall Design....62
4.1 Research hypothesis....62
4.2 Research objects....66

4.3 Research content and steps 66
4.4 Research Technology Roadmap (see Figure 4-1) 67
4.5 Scientific research methods used in the research 67
4.5.1 Systematic review method 67
4.5.2 Defell method 68
4.5.3 Expert scoring method 68
4.5.4 Questionnaire survey method 68
4.5.5 Site investigation method 69
4.5.6 Key Personal Interview and Discussion Method 70
4.5.6.1 Purpose of the interview 70
4.5.6.2 Contents of discussions and interviews 70
4.5.6.3 Interviewees 70
4.5.6.4 Collation of interview data 73
4.5.7 Case analysis method 73
4.6 Statistical analysis 73
4.7 Quality Control 74
4.7.1 Research Plan Design Stage 74
4.7.2 Research Materials Collection Stage 74
4.7.3 Research Materials collation Stage 75
4.8 Summary of This Chapter 75
Chapter 5 Empirical Research Results 76
5.1 Build Collective Leadership Scale 76
5.1.1 Expert Selection for the Delphi Method 77
5.1.2 election of the Delphi Method 77
5.1.3 Quality Control 77
5.1.4 Statistical Methods 78
5.1.5 Summary of Two Rounds of Expert Opinions 78
5.1.6 Test the Reliability and Validity of the Collective Leadership Scale 80
5.2 Measurement of Collective Leadership 84
5.2.1 Measurement Experts and Objects 84
5.2.2 Measurement and Analysis of Collective Leadership of 35 Medical Teams 84

5.3 Influencing Factors and Influencing Mechanisms of Collective Leadership 84
5.3.1 Influencing Factors of Collective Leadership 84
5.3.2 Influencing Mechanisms of Collective Leadership 85
5.3.2.1 The Impact of Gender on Collective Leadership in Medical Management Teams 85
5.3.2.2 The Impact of Number of Members with Higher Degrees on Collective Leadership in Medical Management Teams.....86
5.3.2.3 The Impact of Average Working Years of Medical Management Team Members on Collective Leadership.....87
5.3.2.4 The Impact of Average Age of Medical Management Team Members and the Number of CPC Members on Collective Leadership.....87
5.3.2.5 The Impact of Medical Management Team Members' Participation in Professional Training for Management Positions and the Number of Management Positions They Have Held on Collective Leadership.....88
5.3.2.6 The Impact of Marital Status and Number of Children of Medical Management Team Members on Collective Leadership.....89
5.4 The Impact of Collective Leadership on Employee Satisfaction, Patient Satisfaction, Annual Patient Complaint Rate, Annual Growth of Scientific Research Papers and Departmental Comprehensive Management Performance Score 90
5.4.1 The Impact of Collective Leadership on Employee Satisfaction 90
5.4.2 The Impact of Collective Leadership on Patient Satisfaction 92
5.4.3 The Impact of Collective Leadership on Annual Patient Complaint Rate, Annual Growth in the Number of Scientific Research Papers and Departmental Comprehensive Management Score 94
5.5 Other Findings.....96
5.6 Collective Leadership Model of Medical Team.....96
5.7 Summary of Analysis Results 97
5.8 Conclusion 99
5.9 Summary of This Chapter.....100
Chapter 6 Case Study Results.....101
6.1 Introduction to Case Study Methods.....101

6.2 Hospital Level 103
6.2.1 Hospital Basic Information 103
6.2.2 The operational mechanism of collective leadership of hospital party committees 105
6.2.3 The Direction of the Superior Administrative Department's Assessment of Hospitals 106
6.2.4 Basic Information of the Person in Charge of the Hospital's Clinical Departments 113
6.3 Cardiovascular Department Level 130
6.3.1 Basic Information of Cardiovascular Department 130
6.3.2 Medical Management Team of the Cardiovascular Department 133
6.4 Summary of This Chapter 139
Chapter 7 Discussion and Prospect for Future Research 141
7.1 Discussion 141
7.1.1 Analysis of the Necessity of Choosing a Traditional Chinese Medicine (TCM) Hospital for this Study 141
7.1.2 Analysis of Study Findings 143
7.1.3 Analysis of the Necessity of Collective Leadership in Public Hospitals 144
7.1.4 Analysis of the Applicability of the Collective Leadership Model For Medical Teams 146
7.2 Novelty, Limitations, and Prospects of the Study 147
7.2.1 Novelty of the Study 147
7.2.2 Limitations of the Study 148
7.2.3 Prospects 148
7.3 Summary of this Chapter 150
Appendix 151
Appendix A: Questionnaire for Senior Medical Management Team Members 151
Appendix B: Questionnaire for Medical Management Team Members 154
Appendix C: Employee Satisfaction Questionnaire 156
Appendix D: Inpatient Satisfaction Questionnaire 159
Appendix E: Scoring Rubric of Medical Team's Comprehensive Management

Performance.....162
Appendix F: Interview Outline for Key Interviewees.....173
References.....178
Declaration.....194
Resume.....195

TABLE OF TABLES

Table 3-1Basic Characteristics of Included Literature 54
Table 3-2JBI Literature Quality Assessment Results 55
Table 4-1Study Hypotheses.....65
Table 4-2Basic information of interviewees.....72
Table 5-1Collective Leadership Scale 79
Table 5-2Reliability Test Results of Collective Leadership Scale Items.....80
Table 5-3Results of KMO and Bartlett's Test of Sphericity of the Collective Leadership Scale.....81
Table 5-4Validity Test Results of the Collective Leadership Scale.....81
Table 5-5Analysis on Influencing Factors of Collective Leadership in Medical Management Teams.....85
Table 5-6Reliability and validity Test Results of Employee Satisfaction Questionnaire 91
Table 5-7Analysis of the Impact of Collective Leadership on Employee Satisfaction ...92
Table 5-8Reliability and Validity Test Results of Patient Satisfaction Questionnaire.....93
Table 5-9Analysis of the Impact of Collective Leadership on Patient Satisfaction 94
Table 5-10Analysis on the Impact of Collective Leadership on Annual Patient Complaint Rate, Annual Growth in the Number of Scientific Research Papers and Departmental Comprehensive Management Score 95
Table 5-11Test Results of Research Hypothesis.....98
Table 6-1Case Study Interviewees.....102
Table 6-2National Class III Public Hospital Performance Assessment Indicator System 108
Table 6-3Performance Assessment Indicator System of 22 Hospitals 111
Table 6-4Clinical Department Director Competition Scoring Table.....115
Table 6-5Clinical Head Nurse Competition Scoring Table 125

TABLE OF FIGURES

Figure 1-1 The development of the leadership system of public hospitals in China.....3
Figure 3-1Figure 3-1: Literature Search and Screening Flowchart.....53
Figure 3-2Frequency of Components of Collective Leadership Source: Created by the author.....56
Figure 3-3Radar Chart of Strategies for Enhancing Collective Leadership.....57
Figure 4-1Research Technology Roadmap.....67
Figure 5-1The Impact of Gender on Collective Leadership in Medical Management Teams.....86
Figure 5-2The Impact of Degree Scores of Medical Management Teams on Collective Leadership.....86
Figure 5-3The Impact of Average Working Years of Medical Management Team Members on Collective Leadership.....87
Figure 5-4 Figure 5-5The Impact of Average Age of Medical Management Team Members and the Number of CPC Members on Collective Leadership.....88
Figure 5-6 Figure 5-7The Impact of Whether Members of Medical Management Teams Have Received Management Training for More Than Half A Year, and the Number of Management Positions They Have Held on Collective Leadership.....89
Figure 5-8Figure 5-9The Impact of Marital Status and Number of Children.....90
Figure 5-10Analysis of the Impact of Collective Leadership on Employee Satisfaction 92
Figure 5-11Analysis of the Impact of Collective Leadership on Patient Satisfaction.....94
Figure 5-12Figure 5-13Figure 5-14Analysis on the Impact of Collective Leadership on Annual Patient Complaint Rate, Annual Growth in the Number of Scientific Research Papers and Departmental Comprehensive Management Score.....96
Figure 5-15Collective Leadership Model of Medical Management Team.....97
Figure 6-1The management structure of Beijing JG Class III Public Traditional Chinese Medicine Hospital.....105
Figure 6-2The organizational structure of Beijing JG Class III Public Traditional Chinese Medicine Hospital.....114

Figure 6-3The Organizational Management Structure of the Cardiovascular Department 135
Figure 6-4Educational Background of Cardiovascular Department Staff.....138